

# TRUSTEES OF THE PUBLIC LIBRARY OF THE CITY OF BOSTON

## Meeting of the Trustees as a Corporation and Administrative Agency (First Meeting)

Tuesday, May 16, 2017, 8:30 a.m.  
Boston Public Library, Commonwealth Salon  
Central Library, 700 Boylston Street, Boston, MA 02116

### MINUTES

The annual meeting of the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston was held in the Commonwealth Salon, Central Library, Copley Square, 700 Boylston Street, Boston, MA on Tuesday, May 16, 2017 at 8:30 a.m.

Present at the meeting were: Chair Robert Gallery, Vice- Chair Evelyn Arana-Ortiz Trustees: Representative Byron Rushing, Zamawa Arenas, Ben Bradlee, Jr., Cheryl Cronin, John Hailer, Paul LaCamera. Also present: Boston Public Library President David Leonard, Clerk of the Board Pamela Carver, Boston Public Library staff; Senior Assistant Corporation Counsel Caroline Driscoll, and members of the public.

Chair Robert Gallery presiding, called the meeting to order at 8:35 a.m., greeted all in attendance and proceeded with the agenda. Mr. Gallery called for a motion to approve the minutes of the January 24, 2017 meeting and the Special Trustees Meeting on April 3, 2017. Upon motion duly made and seconded, both meeting minutes were unanimously approved.

David Leonard, President, presented his report by first highlighting some awards that the Library had won for the recent Central Library Renovation. They include: the Charter Award for New Urbanism accepted by William Rawn Associates; the Paul and Nicki Tsongas Award at Preservation Massachusetts accepted by Consigli Construction; the Construction Management Assn. of America Award accepted by PMA and Consigli; the Boston Society of Landscape Architects Award accepted by Reed Hilderbrand, and from the joint American Library Association and the American Institute of Architects, the BPL has won two awards in the same year for the Central and East Boston Branch, which are the highest of awards for Library Architecture in the Industry. He expressed his appreciation to the construction and design partners as well as on behalf of the entire BPL and staff, trustees, to members of both Mayor Menino and Mayor Walsh's teams that shared approval and oversight of these projects. He expressed his gratitude and noted that the BPL is leading in the realm of public libraries in the 21<sup>st</sup> century.

Mr. Leonard noted that the Jamaica Plain Branch library, a 10 million dollar project, that added 20% more space to the footprint, added elevator for full accessibility with enhanced spaces, will be opening to the public on May 20, 2017.

Mr. Leonard stated that the Dudley branch needs to remain closed for an expected two week period due to a failed drain system. The team has gotten to the root of the problem and has started remediation.

The Dudley branch renovation is in the final stage of design. The BPL held its fourth community meeting in participation with other city agencies. The Parker Hill branch was due to close for repairs last fiscal year, but due to scheduling and other constraints, the Parker Hill branch will now close in July 2017 for approximately one year for repairs. This causes an unprecedented situation where two close-by branches will be closed simultaneously. The Dudley Branch's closure will overlap in the late fall/early winter. Mr. Leonard hoped to stagger the closing and minimize the overlap. He added that due to this situation, the BPL is looking to offer more robust temporary services, especially in the Dudley area. The Library surveyed patrons to find out what kind of programming they wanted. The team is actively constructing a model of temporary services that are most important to the patrons for the period of overlap in particular.

Mr. Leonard referred Trustees to the draft of the FY17 Accomplishments and FY18 Goals document, offered as part of the BPL's budget submission to the City.

Mr. Leonard expressed his gratitude for the support of all donors whether direct supporters or mediated through the Foundation, the Citywide and local Friends groups, or through the Map Center and the Associates. He welcomed all of these colleagues to join in the ongoing conversations about how best to grow their combined philanthropic impact supporting library needs and programs. He stated this is strategic priority for FY18. Mr. Leonard be presenting this report to the Boston City Council on May 22, 2017.

There were a few questions in regards to the resolution of the teen center's challenges. Mr. Colford explained that the staff had been meeting with principals from the local charter and neighboring schools. Together they developed a plan on how to work through the issues.

Ms. Arenas congratulated the team on their efforts over the last year. She asked for a better understanding of how the WGBH partnership is working out, especially regarding the programming opportunities for the coming year. Mr. Colford explained that they allowed WGBH some time to get established in their first six months. Since then, WGBH has begun finalizing their scheduling earlier so it is more readily available to the public. The Events, Library Services and Communications managers meet with representatives weekly and monthly to discuss collaborative programming opportunities. Mr. Colford gave an example of the Map Center exhibition on immigration and the youth summer reading programs and their work on gaining WGBH funding to support these programs.

Mr. Leonard added that at the leadership level WGBH agreed to sit down over the summer to take a look back over the last 9 months and take a more formal look ahead to build off of some of their smaller events and look to where the programming can be more systemic.

Ms. Arana-Ortiz said she was pleased to see some vacancies proposed to be filled. Mr. Leonard explained that they did see some increase in staffing levels through the last two budget cycles.

The trustees noted that we are approaching the one year anniversary of the Central Library's Johnson renovation and asked Mr. Leonard for his thoughts on the anniversary. Mr. Leonard stated there are still some lingering challenges but that the public response has exceeded their expectations. They knew it would be more attractive and allow for better service delivery, but the Central library has seen foot traffic up by 20% and in some areas up 40% which he noted is an incredible achievement.

So this shows that public libraries that innovate and renovate are embraced by public and are clearly filling a need. He expressed they are not yet as fully staffed as they want to be given this new level of busyness.

Mr. Gallery added that he and Mr. Hailer attended the Back Bay Association meeting and they pointed to the Boston Public Library as one of the real focal points on Boylston Street, that it was the BPL that changed the landscape. Mr. Gallery also noted continued that the Mayor's has stated that the BPL has been the center of change in this area over the last ten years. Mr. Leonard commented that the Boston Globe recognized the BPL as "a game changer". Mr. Gallery stated that Mr. Leonard has brought a steady hand to the Library in his first year as president and has overseen the successful reopening of the Library, the launch of the Newsfeed Café and is now positioned to build upon that momentum.

Next, The Catered Affair was invited to discuss the expansion of services at the Newsfeed Café, as included in their original proposal. These changes are intended to enhance the BPL standing as a destination, and that part of intent is to provide an experience similar to that offered in museums and other cultural institutions.

Ms. Holly Strafford and Mr. Pierre Prat reviewed their proposal on behalf of The Catered Affair to expand service of beer and wine in the café and part of the Exeter Street patio. They discussed they have held their liquor license at the BPL for five years now without incident. They stated that offering craft beer and wine would encourage patrons who are attending programs and exhibitions at the Library to come earlier or stay after. They proposed offering this service between of 3:00-9:00 p.m. on Monday- Thursday, and Saturday and 3:00-5:00 p.m. on Friday. They reviewed their security plan, which included having a glass wall that would be partially closed during service hours in which egresses would be monitored at all times. Staff would be TIPS certified and they would have appropriate signage to notify patrons that the alcoholic beverages were limited to the enclosed areas only at all times. Service of beer and wine would be available with food only. They noted there will be additional seating just outside the interior glass wall for additional patrons who are not consuming alcohol.

Ms. Cronin commented that she would like to see only quality choices served at the BPL. She pointed that this is an opportunity to teach people about local craft beers and wine products as

well. After a few logistical questions the Chair called on the Trustees to vote. With motion duly made and seconded, the Trustees:

**VOTED: “that, the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston vote to allow The Catered Affair to extend the service of beer and wine to the Newsfeed Café and Exeter Street patio.”**

The next vote before the Board was regarding meeting room policy and procedures. Ms. Emily Tokarczyk reviewed the guidelines that our staff use for community rooms in the system, and nonprofit organizations are allowed to use and reserve. She noted the policies and procedures had not been reviewed since 2006 and they have been updated with a goal of organizing them more clearly and easier to reference. With no questions or edits, the Chair called for a motion. It was duly motioned, seconded and voted:

**VOTED: “that, the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston accept the Meeting Room Policies and Procedures of Boston Public Library.”**

The President’s report concluded and Ms. Laura Irmischer, Chief of Collections briefed the Board of Trustees on behalf of the Special Collections Committee on the vote brought before them to transfer a portion of the sound recordings collections to the Internet Archives.

Ms. Irmischer explained what the Sound Archives included and specified what portion of the collection is for consideration today, specifically the LPs and 78 rpm recordings. These are commercial recordings that the Library has collected over time in various genres including: American popular music, classical, rock, jazz, some spoken word, and opera. The time period runs from the early 1900s to the 1980s. The recordings are on vinyl and shellac discs in ten and twelve inch diameters. By way of reference, she explained the Library had a flood in 1998 and the collection was severely affected. Some albums were lost to damage and some covers were destroyed and could not be salvaged. As a result, some of the albums are now stored in plain white jackets to protect the discs. The current status of this collection is considered a “closed collection” due to a lack of listening equipment or listening stations for the public to access it and also the fragility of the material. The recordings have not been cataloged and therefore there is no way to let the public know what is in the collection. It is currently stored in unsuitable conditions in the Johnson basement. Several years ago, the BPL began communicating with the Internet Archive to partner with them on digitizing the collection.

In 2010, the Special Collections subcommittee recommended to deaccession this collection, to the Internet Archive. This was around the time of the recession and library resources were redirected elsewhere, therefore this proposal did not move forward at the time. Ms. Irmischer stated they have resumed discussions with the Internet Archive which is increasingly interested in moving forward. The Archive has proposed to digitize the collection and will also pay for the packing and transport to their facilities, as well as the digitization and proper storage of the

archived collection. In addition, the Archive will provide the BPL with copies of each of the digitized files and will allow the Library the first right of refusal should they no longer want this collection in the future. It was made clear that this is only for the commercial recordings and does not include items from any of the fifteen special collections. Ms. Irmischer reviewed the guidelines of the Collections Development Policy that covers deaccession of collections in Appendix D, which references the American Library Association “standard for ethical conduct for rare book and manuscript and special collections librarians”. It emphasizes three key points to consider: 1) public interest 2) research and scholarly community, and 3) the deaccession is handled in an open and public manner. Ms. Irmischer explained how deaccessioning the collection to the Internet Archives would benefit the research and scholarly community because the public would have access to use them. We brought this matter to the Special collections Committee and they voted to bring this matter for a vote to the full Board.

Mr. Gallery stated that we are not getting rid of it, just to dispose of the collection, but rather transferring it with the express intent of providing access. Ms. Irmischer agreed that they purposely chose to work with partner who will make them accessible. The collection will be accessible on the internet and will be stored in a proper environment.

Ms. Cronin asked if someone wanted to access an original LP would they be able to do so. Ms. Irmischer explained that the Internet Archives would store them at their facilities in California and they would not be able to access the originals. She also noted that the BPL does not have any listening devices to play them either. The Board discussed some of their concerns regarding giving up the rights to the collection and asked for Ms. Irmischer to try to seek a co-ownership option. Ms. Irmischer explained that the BPL is insisting on first right of refusal should the Internet Archive no longer want the collection, but, the agreement would be transferring ownership to the Internet Archives. Mr. Leonard added that they have asked for language in the agreement to return any unique pieces that are discovered during this process and that they will also credit the BPL as the source of these objects made available digitally. He explained the BPL has a longstanding relationship with the Internet Archive.

The Board expressed some concerns on giving up the collection and asked if there were any efforts to see if local musical educational institutions may have an interest in it. Ms. Irmischer explained that the BPL reached out to local institutions when they were preparing for the Johnson renovation, and discovered that part of the collection was donated to us years ago when such organizations no longer wanted these items. She also explained that if we chose to keep the collection, we would need to empty the Archival Center in West Roxbury or build a new building to properly store the 200,000 items.

Mr. Gallery called on Bill Stoneman, Special Collections Committee Chair, to add his thoughts on this. Mr. Stoneman explained that this is a great opportunity. The Internet Archives are giving the BPL the content; the BPL can build a digital common-wealth. Mr. Stoneman stated every time a record is played it loses some of its vinyl. He restated that these are commercial

recordings. He explained this process is no different from book deaccessions and that he felt it was a fair deal. He was in favor of the transfer.

Ms. Cronin stated that the BPL should try to reserve as many of our rights as possible but felt it was good for the Library overall. Mr. LaCamera agreed and replied the Library will have full access to the contents, and access to the content is the point. Representative Rushing stated he was in support of this.

After an exhaustive discussion, it was expressed that the Special Collections Committee and the Chief of Collections are in favor of a favorable vote. Gallery stated he appreciated the dialogue but called for a vote. A motion was duly made, seconded, and voted with a condition of clarifying the questions of retaining ownership, memorializing the rights of access and the Trustee seeing a copy of the agreement:

**VOTED: “that, the Trustees of the Public Library for the City of Boston deaccession and transfer approximately 200,000 sound recordings on 78rpm and LP format from the Sound Archives collection to the Internet Archive for the purposes of digitization, with the condition of clarifying the questions of ownership.”**

Ms. Arana-Ortiz reviewed the Operating and Capital Budget for FY18, as reviewed and approved by the Finance and Audit Committee. She explained this does not require a vote but rather the obligation is simply to inform the Board. Ms. Ellen Donaghey, Chief Financial Officer, gave a report and a brief overview of the budget. She pointed out that City Budget is 4.4% higher than the FY17 year’s budget and includes an increase for our Collections budget of \$160,000, \$328,000 for the Chinatown Library services and a Copley Custodial Supervisor position. This is an increase of five and a half positions. This also includes the routine salary increases. Because the Library’s union contracts have expired, there are no cost of living increases in the budget aside from routine step increases. There were no questions regarding the City Budget.

Ms. Donaghey moved onto to show the External budget, which represents non-city funding. She noted that overall, we anticipating spending approximately \$8.9m, which is consistent with FY17. Affiliate funding, representing the Foundation, the Associates and Friends groups, will be approximately \$1m. Ms. Donaghey explained the two outstanding items are the Library of the Commonwealth of approximately \$2.5 million and State Aid. Both numbers are based upon the Governor’s budget, which was released in January. The House budget did include increases and we are awaiting a final budget for FY18.

Ms. Arana-Ortiz next called on Mr. Matt Hunt from CliftonLarsonAllen to review the Management Letter. She was happy to note that there were no findings in Finance and only a few in Information Technology but pointed out that Mr. Leonard is actively seeking a Chief Technology Officer. Mr. Matthew Hunt explained they had six recommendations for the Library. He briefly reviewed those with the Board and explained there were no internal weaknesses of control. Mr. Hunt noted that most of the recommendations have either already been addressed or have a plan in place already. With no questions or objections, Ms. Arana-Ortiz called for a vote to accept the Management Letter. On a motion made and duly seconded, it was:

**VOTED: “that, the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston vote to accept the Draft Management Letter for the fiscal year ending June 30, 2016, from CliftonLarsonAllen, LLP, Certified Public Accountants.”**

Ms. Arana-Ortiz asked the Trustees to consider voting to approve two standard annual votes as a lot. Upon motion duly made and seconded the Trustees:

**VOTED: “that, the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston authorize the President, or designee, on behalf of the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston, to enter into a contract or contracts for various goods or services relating to the Boston Public Library Critical Repair Budget for the period July 1, 2017 through June 30, 2018 provided that each contract entered into pursuant to this authorization shall have been estimated to be less than one hundred thousand dollars (\$100,000.00). In no event will the contracts cumulatively exceed three hundred thousand dollars (\$300,000.00).”**

**VOTED: “that, the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston enter into a non-advertised contract, as authorized under G.L., c.30-B, Section 7(a), referred to as a “Procurement of Library Books,” between the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston (a Corporation under Chapter 114 of the Acts of 1878), and the vendors listed therein (including any subsidiaries or agents), for the acquisitions of books and for certain other library bibliographical acquisitions materials, in an amount not to exceed the amount appropriated in the Library Department budget for books and other related bibliographical acquisitions materials, during the period July 1, 2017 through June 30, 2018.”**

Next, Ms. Arana-Ortiz asked the Board to vote for the annual distribution of funds for the Fellowes Athenaeum Fund which provides instructional programming at the Dudley Library. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Board:

**VOTED: “that, the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston approve the expenditure from the Fellowes Athenaeum Trust**

**Fund in an amount not to exceed ninety five thousand one hundred dollars and no cents (\$95,100) to support the Fellowes Athenaeum Trust Fund Programmatic Plan for FY18 as recommended by the Fellowes Athenaeum Trust Advisory Committee and to be presented at an upcoming meeting.”**

Ms. Arana-Ortiz explained the standard annual votes before the Trustees that were recommended by the Finance and Audit Committee:

With no questions or objections, upon motion made and duly seconded, the Trustees unanimously voted:

**VOTED: “that, the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston approve a contract for conservation work not to exceed \$150,000 be entered into with Northeast Document Conservation Center, funding provided by the Associates of the Boston Public Library.”**

**VOTED: “that, the Trustees of the Public Library authorize the temporary hiring of part-time contract employees in the Content Discovery Department, to include photographers to provide part-time temporary support in the Content Discovery Department, not to exceed \$32,000 in a one year period per individual; photographer assistants not to exceed \$15,000 in a one year period per individual; metadata assistants not to exceed \$15,000 in a one year period total cost not to exceed the \$110,000, funding provided by the Associates of the Boston Public Library.**

Ms. Arana-Ortiz explained that the next vote allows delegation of certain contract approvals for the Board of Trustees in the event of an emergency. She noted that some contracts may require approval during the summer months when the full board does not typically meet. Upon a motion duly made and seconded, it was:

**VOTED: that, the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston delegate approval of any contract deemed to be of a critical nature by the President of the Library during the period between May 2017 and September 2017 to the Finance and Audit Committee.**

Next, the acceptance of the transfer of certain restricted endowments held by the Foundation. Upon motion duly made and seconded, it was:

**VOTED: “that, the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston approve the transfer of certain restricted endowments held by the Foundation for the benefit of the Boston Public Library.”**

**VOTED: “that, the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston approve the selection of Program Partners for Fiscal Year FY18, final amounts dependent upon available funds.”**

Mr. Gallery asked the Trustees vote to approve the schedule of Trustees Meetings for 2016-2017 calendar year. Upon motion duly made and seconded, the Trustees voted:

**VOTED: “that, the Trustees of the Public Library of the City of Boston approve the proposed schedule of Trustees meetings for 2016-2017 as noted below:”**

- Thursday, September 28, 2017, 3:00 p.m., Dudley Branch
- Thursday, November 16, 2017, 3:00 p.m., Jamaica Plain Branch
- Tuesday, January 30, 2018, 9:00 a.m., East Boston Branch
- Thursday, March 29, 2018, 5:00 p.m., Roslindale Branch
- Tuesday May 8, 2018, 8:30 a.m., Annual Meeting, Central Library

***\*Meetings are subject to change***

Mr. Leonard noted most of the meetings are in the branches and the some of the meeting times were made to accommodate schedules of the public who may not be able to attend during regular business hours.

Mr. Gallery asked if there was any New Business. Mr. Hailer thanked Mr. Leonard and Ms. Carver for a seamless transition this year and the other members collectively agreed.

With no further business, Mr. Gallery called for Public Comment. Gail, a member of the Faneuil Branch Friends proposed for budget consideration during the preparation and planning of the 2018 (FY19) budget that the Faneuil Branch is in. Mr. Leonard responded that Faneuil is slated for the full budget amount, but is not expected to have activity prior to the design phase in 2019, but this would be reviewed in the Capital planning process that starts in November.

Elissa Cadillic, President of AFSCME spoke on behalf of Gretchen Grozier, Co-chair of JP Friends group. On behalf of Ms. Grozier, she asked that this Board consider the full staffing request in the budget for the Jamaica Plain Branch. This request was not included in the FY18 budget and she asks that the Board advocate for this.

Elissa Cadillic spoke again in her capacity as President of ASFSME. She was pleased to see new positions, and also sought improvement to labor relations and communications. She felt there was a long way to go with management. Evelyn has said she is tired of hearing about this. Elissa replied I am too. We need more staff, as a result of the renovations and changes, need to ensure that they are adequately staffed, not just at the budget hearing. Ms. Cadillic expressed that she was pleased to see the in-depth conversation the Board had regarding matter of the Sound

Archives plan. She felt this is the type of deliberation the Board should engage in. She would like to note that the Board approved a number of contract positions in digitization and she feels it would be more cost effective and a better result to have this role be a BPL staff person rather than advocate each year for a temporary contract.

David Vieira, President of Citywide Friends discussed the removal of the handicapped access ramp on McKim Building. He understands it was a temporary ramp connected to the renovation approved by the Landmarks Commission and that the BPL was obligated to remove it given that the Johnson renovation is complete. He stated he hopes the Library will work to have a permanent solution installed so that both entrances accessible.

Mr. Leonard stated he would be happy to take part in the dialogue about how to move this item forward. Dave Vieira commended the Trustees on their thoughtful discussion on Collections today.

With no further business the Chair adjourned the first meeting at 10:16 a.m.

Respectively submitted,

*Pamela R. Carver, Clerk of the Board*